IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS DIVISION OF ST. CROIX

MOHAMMAD HAMED, by his authorized agent WALEED HAMED,

Plaintiff,

v.

FATHI YUSUF and UNITED CORPORATION,

Defendants.

CIVIL NO. SX-12-CV-370

ACTION FOR DAMAGES, INJUNCTIVE AND DECLARATORY RELIEF

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

PLAINTIFF HAMED'S RESPONSE

TO DEFENDANTS' RULE 17 MOTION TO STRIKE REPRESENTATIVE

Plaintiff submits this memorandum in response to Defendants' Rule 17 motion to strike Waleed Hamed as the "authorized agent" of Plaintiff Mohammad Hamed. The plaintiff in this case is Mohammed Hamed, not Waleed Hamed. In this regard, Rule 17 provides in part as follows:

Rule 17. Plaintiff and Defendant; Capacity; Public Officers (a) Real Party in Interest.

(1) *Designation in General.* An action must be prosecuted in the name of the real party in interest....

Defendant is apparently confused about either the caption or Rule 17. Rule 17 prevents a person or entity for filing a suit in the place of the party in interest. In that event, the plaintiff here would have been "Wally Hamed" or "Wally Hamed as the authorized agent for Mohammad Hamed." However, the plaintiff is listed in the caption and described in the amended complaint as Mohammad Hamed. (Dist. Ct. D.E. 15). There is no attempt to make Waleed Hamed the Plaintiff.

Thus, Mohammad Hamed can neither "join" nor "substitute" as suggested by the defendants. Similarly, Waleed Hamed cannot be "stricken" as the party in interest or

Plaintiff's Response Re Rule 17 Page 2

13

plaintiff -- as he is not listed as either. However, this analysis is not necessary as Rule

17(c) allows for a party to clarify any doubt about this issue. Stating as follows:

(3) Joinder of the Real Party in Interest. The court may not dismiss an action for failure to prosecute in the name of the real party in interest until, after an objection, a reasonable time has been allowed for the real party in interest to ratify, join, or be substituted into the action. After ratification, joinder, or substitution, the action proceeds as if it had been originally commenced by the real party in interest.

See, e.g., ICON Group, Inc. v. Mahogany Run Dev. Corp., 829 F.2d 473, 477 (3d Cir.

1987)(ratification cures any question about who the party in interest might be).

In this regard, to the extent there is any doubt about this issue, attached is a declaration confirming and ratifying this pursuant to Rule 17(a)(3). Exhibit 1. In short, the motion is clearly mooted by the filing of this declaration.

Thus, the motion should be denied in all respects. A proposed order is attached

that makes it clear that Mohammad Hamed is the party plaintiff bringing this action.

Dated: December 4, 2012

Joel H. Holt, Esq. Counsel for Plaintiff Law Offices of Joel H. Holt 2132 Company Street, Christiansted, VI 00820

Carl J. Hartmann III, Esq. Co-Counsel for Plaintiff 5000 Estate Coakley Bay, Unit L-6 Christiansted, VI 00820 Plaintiff's Response Re Rule 17 Page 3

V

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on December 4, 2012, a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was forwarded via USPS and email to the following:

Joseph A. DiRuzzo, III Fuerst Ittleman David & Joseph, PL 1001 Brickell Bay Drive, 32nd. Fl. 2006 Miami, FL 33131

Nizar A. DeWood The Dewood Law Firm Eastern Suburb, Suite 101 Christiansted, VI 00820

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS DIVISION OF ST. CROIX

MOHAMMAD HAMED, by his authorized agent WALEED HAMED,

Plaintiff,

v.

3

CIVIL NO. SX-12-CV-370

FATHI YUSUF and UNITED CORPORATION,

Defendants.

ACTION FOR DAMAGES, INJUNCTIVE AND DECLARATORY RELIEF

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

DECLARATION OF PLAINTIFF MOHAMMED HAMED

I, Mohammad Hamed, declare, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 1746, as follows:

1. I am the plaintiff in the captioned action before this Court.

2. If there is any doubt with regard to my status as the plaintiff and real party

in interest in this action, I hereby confirm and ratify that I am the plaintiff pursuing this claim against the defendants.

3. I also confirm that my son Waleed Hamed is not the plaintiff.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

EXHIBIT

Mohammad Hamed

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS DIVISION OF ST. CROIX

MOHAMMAD HAMED, by his authorized agent WALEED HAMED,

Plaintiff,

ν.

FATHI YUSUF and UNITED CORPORATION,

Defendants.

CIVIL NO. SX-12-CV-370

ACTION FOR DAMAGES, INJUNCTIVE AND DECLARATORY RELIEF

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

ORDER

This Matter having come before the Court on Defendants' motion pursuant to Rule 17, it is hereby

ORDERED and ADJUDGED

That the motion is denied as Mohammad Hamed has confirmed pursuant to Rule 17(c) that he is the plaintiff in the captioned action before this Court, not Waleed Hamed.

Hon. Darryl D. Donohue Presiding Judge

<u>A T T E S T:</u> VENETIA VELASQUEZ Clerk of the Court

BY:

 \hat{Q}

Deputy Clerk

Dist: Joel H. Holt, Esq. Joseph A. DiRuzzo, III Nizar A. DeWood